

Appendix

Joint review of Community-Based Management: form

The following review form is based on one used in Samoa. The purpose of the review is to assist the Fisheries Management Committee (FMC) to review its performance and to make any improvements necessary. The review aims to measure how effectively the Village Fisheries Management Plan has been used by the village, and how well the community has carried out its own undertakings.

The Joint Review should take place about 6 months after the Village Fisheries Management Plan has been approved, and at a time proposed by the community (and recorded in the plan). Because the village must consider this review as their own, extension staff must be very open in their investigation and avoid being seen as policemen. No investigation should be made by extension staff without the full knowledge of the FMC.

Before going to the village **a) collect all relevant information from records**. Then go to the village to interview FMC members as a group on **b) their performance** and **c) the undertakings of the community**. While in the village, **d) interview 10 other people from the community**. The following form should be used to record the information collected and calculate a total score for the village.



VILLAGE: STAFF: DATE(S):

A) INFORMATION FROM RECORDS

Staff should use information from their work and findings in the village concerned to circle either very good (score = 4), good (score 3), average (score 2), poor (score 1) or very poor (score 0)

If the village has a Fish Reserve, do records show that the community has shown good care by:

- Cooperating/participating in surveys? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4
- Marking the reserve boundaries? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4
- Enforce rules banning fishing? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4

SUBSECTION SCORE = out of 12

If the village has giant clams, do records show that the community has shown good care by:

- Removing predators regularly? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4
- Cleaning cages regularly? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4
- Preventing loss by theft? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4

SUBSECTION SCORE = out of 12

If the village has tilapia, do records show that the community has shown good care by:

- Feeding the fish regularly? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4
- Maintaining the pond? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4
- Making regular catches? [very good] [good] [average] [poor] [very poor] SCORE /4

SUBSECTION SCORE = out of 12

ACTUAL SCORE = out of possible marks. **CORRECT TO** out of 20
(if out of 12 then times by 20/12; if out of 24 then times by 20/24; if out of 36 then times by 20/36)

B) INTERVIEW WITH FMC MEMBERS

On the day of the Review, meet with the FMC members to discuss the review. Suggest that the process should be as honest/unbiased and thorough as possible and that it would be desirable, for example, to interview a range of villagers not involved in the FMC.

How many people were on the FMC originally? people.

How many people are on the FMC now? people.

If people have left the FMC, why is this?

If no decrease in people score 2; if decrease of 1-3 score 1; if more than 3 score 0 >> SCORE = /2

What additional relevant activities has the FMC undertaken other than those in the management plan?

.....

If activities undertaken score 1; if no activities undertaken score 0 >>> SCORE = /1

In the last three months;

How many times has the FMC held meetings? times.

If 3 or more meetings score 3; if 2 score 2; if 1 score 1, if 0 score 0 >>>

SCORE = out of 3

On average, how many people attend each FMC meeting? people.

If more than 8 people score = 3; if 6 to 8 =2; if 3 to 5 =1, if less than 3 = 0 >>>

SCORE = out of 3

How many times have meetings been held with other people in the village? times

If 3 or more meetings score 3; if 2 score 2; if 1 score 1, if 0 score 0 >>>

SCORE = out of 3

How many times has the FMC reported to the village leaders? times

If 3 or more meetings score 3; if 2 score 2; if 1 score 1, if 0 score 0 >>>

SCORE = out of 3

ACTUAL SCORE = out of 15.

C) INTERVIEW WITH FMC MEMBERS ON UNDERTAKINGS

Examine each undertaking one by one and consider the following

If the undertaking involves a conservation activity, has this been carried out?

If the undertaking involves a rule or regulation, is the rule being enforced, how many people are breaking the rule, and how many people have had to pay a penalty for breaking this law?

UNDERTAKING

How well has the undertaking been carried out? [very well] [well] [not well] [very poorly]

(Score 3 for very well; 2 for well; 1 for not well; 0 for very poorly) >>>> SCORE = /3

(Repeat the above for all of the village undertakings. Obtain the total score the following way:)

TOTAL NUMBER OF UNDERTAKINGS (U) =

TOTAL SCORE (S) =.....out of a maximum possible score (3 times U) of.....

CORRECT TO out of 50 (by calculating $S \times 50 / (3 \times U)$)

Example - If the community has 6 undertakings the maximum possible score (3 times U) is 18

If the village scored 12, multiply this by $50/18$ to give 33

What more could the village/FMC/agency be doing to protect its fish stock and its marine environment?

.....

.....

.....



D) INTERVIEW WITH OTHER VILLAGERS

Choose 10 adults (not FMC members) at random. Out of the ten people you interviewed:

- How many know that this village has a Fisheries Management Plan? SCORE = *people* *out of 10*
- How many have seen the Fisheries Management Plan? SCORE = *people* *out of 10*
- How many know the name of at least one of the FMC members? SCORE = *people* *out of 10*
- How many think that having a Fisheries Management Plan is good? SCORE = *people* *out of 10*

What more could the village/FMC/agency be doing to protect fish stocks and the marine environment?

.....
.....

TOTAL SCORE = out of 40. **CORRECT TO**out of 15 (times total score by 15/40)

TOTAL SCORE FOR THE REVIEW

Section A = out of 20
 Section B = out of 15
 Section C = out of 50
 Section D = out of 15
TOTAL = out of 100

ASSESSMENT OF FISHERIES DIVISION PERFORMANCE

Explain that this is a joint review, and FMC members must have the right to comment on the performance of extension staff. Encourage members to be honest in their comments, and to highlight any areas where support should be improved.

.....
.....